

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE  
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Thursday, June 6, 2024**

**12:30 p.m.**

**Hybrid**

**Zoom**

**&**

**Library Learning Commons, L1-13**

**1700 Spring Garden Street**

**Philadelphia, PA 19130**

- Presiding:** Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend
- Committee Members:** Ms. Mindy Posoff, Mr. Patrick Clancy, Ms. Sheila Ireland, Ms. Roz McPherson
- Board Participants:** Mr. Harold Epps
- College Members:** Dr. Donald Generals, Dr. Alycia Marshall, Dr. Mellissia Zanjani, Dr. David Thomas, Dr. Danielle Liautaud-Watkins, Dr. Vance Gray, Dr. Shannon Rooney, Dr. Darren Lipscomb, Mary Berman
- Guests:** Dr. Judith Gay, Consultant to the Board of Trustees  
Dr. Vishal Shah, Dean of Math, Science and Health Careers  
Theresa Grady, Dental Hygiene Program Director  
Michele Dattilo, Department Head, Allied Health/ Part-Time Faculty in Dental Hygiene  
Christine Griffin, Dental Hygiene Assistant Professor  
Devona Williams, Dental Hygiene student  
Jean Kim, Dental Hygiene student  
Dr. Amy Birge-Caracappa, Director of Assessment  
Elizabeth Gordon, Assessment Manager  
Dr. Eric Shannon, Director of Institutional Research  
Dial Thomas, Assessment Specialist

**I. Public Session**

- (a) Introductions (I)
- (b) Approval of the Minutes of the May 2, 2024 meeting (A)

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend made a motion to approve the meeting minutes of the May 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting. Trustee McPherson moved the motion, and Trustee Clancy seconded. All were in favor. The meeting minutes of the May 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting were approved.

Dr. Marshall opened the meeting by sharing the long history of the Dental Hygiene program's success with students and the field since it was established in 1976. One of the biggest highlights of the program is the free service it provides for over 800 patients in the tri-state area annually, via the program's dental hygiene clinic. This service is critical to the College's mission and is carried out with kindness by experts.

Theresa Grady shared that the Dental Hygiene program is accredited every seven years by the Commission on Dental Accreditation of the American Dental Association (CODA), a specialized accrediting body recognized by the Council on Post-Secondary Accreditation and the U.S. Department of Education. There will be an upcoming site visit in October 2024. The program prepares its graduates to be competent oral health clinicians and educators, and the curriculum instructs them to treat oral disease and prevention. Ms. Grady informed the Board that the Dental Hygiene field is expected to grow 7% faster than all other professions. The mean pay in 2023 for a hygienist after graduation was \$87,000.

Dr. Birge-Caracappa explained to the Board that the Dental Hygiene program is a cohort-based program. While no class was admitted in 2020 due to COVID-19, the program recovered quickly. The average enrollment between Spring 2019 and Fall 2023 was 53. The program enrolls a larger average proportion of full-time students (47.5%) than the College overall (30.4%). 88.1% of students within the program are over 21 years of age, which is higher than the College average of 57%. Between Fall 2018 and Fall 2022, 56.3% of Dental Hygiene students returned to the same program from one year to the next, compared to the College overall percentage, which was 35.1%. As with many selective admission programs, there is a racial disparity in the program, as it enrolls a disproportionately higher percentage of white females (46.5%) compared to the College average (14.3%), and a disproportionately lower percentage of Black females (10.9%) compared to the College average (30.4%). The average percentage of students who identify as Asian females in the program (11.3%) is higher than the College average (5.9%).

From the period of 2016-2023 (except 2022, when there was no graduating class due to COVID-19), an average of 97% of Dental Hygiene graduates have passed the National Board Dental Hygiene Exam, and 97% have found employment as a licensed dental hygienist or were pursuing further education nine months after graduation. From Spring 2019 to Fall 2023, 100% of Dental Hygiene students were in good standing. Over the period studied, the Dental Hygiene program awarded 98 A.A.S. degrees. The program uses a formal and ongoing outcomes assessment process and has made several enhancements based on the assessment data collected and analyzed. Assessment results are regularly discussed among program faculty, the Allied Health department head, the dean, and advisory committee members.

Theresa Grady, herself a CCP Dental Hygiene alum who graduated in 1984, invited students Devona Williams and Jean Kim to share the student perspective of the program with the Board. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked the students to share why they chose the program, their experience, what is working well, what they appreciate, and what could be improved. Ms. Williams became a Dental Hygiene student at the College after enrolling in Nursing and Radiology technician courses. Later, she realized her passion was in helping people smile and maintaining their overall health. She chose CCP specifically because there were not a lot of colleges in the Pittsburgh area that offered Dental Hygiene. She was also drawn to the College

because the education offered was affordable. After enrolling, she was grateful for the support offered by the faculty throughout her learning experiences. She hopes to receive her bachelor's degree within the next year or two.

Another student, Jean Kim, shared that she learned about the program at the College while working at a dental hygiene office where the hygienist was an alumnus of the CCP Dental Hygiene program. The hygienist student expressed that if she enrolled in the program, she would be well prepared after completing her studies and ready to work in an office to provide patient care. Although she lived close to Montgomery County Community College, the high board pass rate of the CCP program indicated that it's dedicated to the success of the students. Ms. Kim is confident about taking the board examination. Additionally, the diverse patient population of varying dental health and conditions helped her gain the needed experience to succeed in the field.

Faculty member and college alumna Christine Griffin, who graduated 22 years ago in 2002, chose to attend the College because Bucks County didn't offer a dental hygiene program. After working as a temporary assistant in an office, she began looking into hygiene programs and found that the CCP was the most affordable. When she graduated in 2002, there was a shortage of hygienists, which resulted in many opportunities being offered to her. She felt that she was adequately prepared and passed her boards because of her former teachers, such as Theresa Grady. Ms. Griffin worked full-time and earned her bachelor's and master's degrees. She then returned to the College to teach. She is grateful she had the chance to work at the college she attended – which has allowed her to have a shared perspective as a faculty and student. Her dentist, who is based in Yardley, shared with her that he only hires CCP hygienists because of their skill level. She has confidence in the students at the College in what they learn, knowing they will be successful.

Michele Dattilo is a part-time faculty member in Dental Hygiene and the Department Head of Allied Health. She began teaching at the College in 2010 and believes that the program prepares students to take their boards and be successful within the field. The experience of caring for a diverse mix of patients helps the students become culturally competent.

- Trustee Clancy inquired whether any male students were enrolled in the program. Ms. Dattilo informed the Board that six male students had recently enrolled. During COVID-19, around twelve male students enrolled. Ms. Griffin added that the Dental Hygiene field is breaking the mold due to the stereotype that healthcare is a field for women. However, over the years of teaching, she's starting to see more males getting involved.
- Trustee Clancy asked if there was a job shortage in the field. Both Ms. Grady and Ms. Griffin confirmed that there is a shortage and that students often have multiple jobs lined up simultaneously.
- Trustee Clancy confirmed whether graduates can practice being a dental hygienist without passing the board exams. Both Ms. Grady and Ms. Dattilo informed the Board that students are required to pass three licensing examinations to become a Dental Hygienist after two years of education at the college. One exam is clinical, another is the slide exam, and the other is an eight-hour written exam that is like the Scholastic Assessment Test. The slide and written tests are administered by the American Dental Association (ADA), the Commission on Dental Competency Assessments (CDCA), and the Western Regional Examining Board (WREB), and the clinical tests are administered

on the college campus in the dental clinic. Ms. Dattilo stated that dental hygienists do not have reciprocity like other healthcare professionals. If a dental hygienist wants to practice in another state, they will have to apply for additional exams and another license, which is costly. Dr. Generals shared that the reciprocity issue often comes up in many workforce areas and can be challenging for students.

- Trustee Clancy asked about the number of applications submitted to the program. Ms. Grady informed him that around 200 prospective students submit applications; however, only 34 students are accepted. The nursing Kaplan exam is required for acceptance.
- Trustee Epps shared that he met a dental hygienist student who said that they would scale their experience in the program as a 10.

Ms. Grady shared with the Board a few improvements within the Dental Hygiene department that have recently been made, such as the recent clinic renovation. Through the last seven years, approximately \$600,000 has been provided through the Perkins Grant fund. The program has been working on eliminating the need for paper by incorporating digital and electronic technology used for patient treatment, pedagogy, and records to reduce the department's carbon footprint. A full-time radiology lab aide has been hired to assist with mannequins, hand out the various sensors, and assist students for safety purposes.

- Trustee Epps asked about the critical gate that prevents that number of enrollments from being higher than 30 students per year, and if the demand is higher. Ms. Grady informed the Board that the program is mandated by accreditation and that each student has their own dental unit. They are able to double the number of students in the program by having a day clinic and night clinic. Increasing the number of students enrolled would result in more time, resources and space.
- Dr. Shah stated that the difference between the Dental Hygiene program and other programs is that students in the program can stay on-site for the clinic. If more students were enrolled in the program, the clinic would need to be expanded, and more faculty would be needed. He informed the Board of where the renovated dental clinic is located. One of the standout features of the College's clinic that differs from clinics at other institutions is the College's equipment — real X-ray machines and two units aligned with what is found in professional dentist offices. Additionally, the CODA accreditation requires every student not to see only one type of patient but instead a diversity of patients and conditions such as geriatric and pediatric.
- Trustee Epps asked if there was enough demand for the Dental Hygiene field to contemplate expanding the program.
- Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked if the number of prospective students who apply to the program is known. Ms. Grady informed her that the information is typically available once all applications are reviewed, including what classes students have taken and whether they are qualified to be accepted into the program.

Dr. Birge-Caracappa shared another action item from the APR that addresses the disparities in racial equity, with an emphasis on factors that affect students before they apply to the program. Some of the suggested strategies include outreach to students currently enrolled in Anatomy and Physiology courses; outreach to the wider Philadelphia community through clinic patients,

particularly those with longstanding relationships with the Dental Hygiene program; and targeted efforts toward recruiting male students.

Dr. Shah talked about a task force that has been created to investigate how to ensure that selective admission program enrollment mirrors the institution's enrollment. What does the field look like today? The national numbers reflect that only 5% of the entire Dental Hygiene enrollment in the country are males. How can the College make a difference and change those numbers? Hopefully, next year, the task force will have the action items needed for the College to implement recommendations and make a difference.

- Trustee Clancy asked whether some students aren't accepted into the program due to courses they didn't pass. How does the College begin to look at bridging potential applicants into the program? Is there a Kaplan test prep?
- Dr. Shah stated that the department normally, right now, doesn't have much mechanism for training the students in Kaplan. Students' GPA is a second variable.
- Ms. Grady also mentioned that a student's performance in science classes is a big predictor because most of the program courses are science-based. She stated that Kaplan prep tests are available online and through test books.
- Ms. Dattilo expressed that potential students must have a strong science background. If not, they are being set up for failure.
- Trustee Epps asked what the activity-based pro forma for the program would be if expansion were considered. What would be the cost to run the program? If further conversation arises, he would like an activity-based pro forma, PNL, for the Dental Hygienist program.

Dr. Marshall stated that the Dental Hygiene program is strong and that the students and faculty are impressive. She referenced the issue of student demographics across the board in selective admissions programs — an issue that is currently being worked on through the healthcare taskforce. The aforementioned task force is also working on how to prepare students for Kaplan for multiple programs, including DMI and Nursing. The importance of field representation is understood, as is the College's commitment as a minority-serving institution and its need to be involved in changing that demographic in the field. She recommended that the program be approved for another five years.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend and the committee of the Board collectively approved the Associate in Applied Science Program for another five years. She then asked for more information regarding the task force and the timeline.

Dr. Marshall informed the Board that progress would likely take a year. Work would begin in the fall and be implemented into the spring, working toward the next cohort of recruits. Department heads and the leadership of the targeted programs are opting into the plan. The Academic & Student Success Division's goal is to eliminate racial equity gaps, and the Division also works towards access, developing students, and preparing them for living wages. Part of the plan is to get these programs' department heads and leaders together to strategize and consider how we can reach more diverse students in support of broadening representation within the field. She would also like to connect with leaders familiar with various fields and

barriers, talk realistically about what they think recommendations should be, present those recommendations, and work towards implementing them.

- Trustee Epps stated that both selective admissions programs (Dental Hygiene and DMI) are capped because of physical equipment and space constraints. Do the applicant pools have the same demographics as the acceptance pool? How would we take into consideration diversity in the selection process?
- Dr. Marshall explained that the challenges are being investigated: What *is* the challenge? Is it the students who are applying? Are we not even reaching certain populations? For example, some students aren't opting in and don't even think to apply to the Dental Hygiene program because it's not on their radar. Healthcare programs can do a better job of informing students about multiple disciplines and multiple opportunities. Part of the issue that needs to be addressed is finding out who's in the field and who they see and then also working on diversifying the faculty. There is a space issue also, but in programs like DMI, the clinical rotation requirements and lack of availability of sites also presents a challenge.
- Trustee McPherson asked: When it comes to integrated medicine, how do we talk to prospective students or high school students about how integrated medicine is intertwined with dental health and the rest of the body to inform prospective high school and college students and patients?
- Dr. Marshall stated that the marketing message of dental care needs to be presented. The departments do a good job with information sessions about healthcare programs. Additionally, the College has an entry-level health care pathway course (Allied Health 101) that students enroll in when studying at the College. In this course, they are exposed to a variety of healthcare pathways.

In closing, Dr. Marshall shared the following announcements with the Board regarding healthcare faculty.

- Four nursing faculty members traveled to Poland to present topics related to Geriatrics.
  - o Laureen Tavolaro-Riley presented What Matters Most to Older Adults
  - o Lisa Johnson presented Geriatric Syndromes
  - o Tamisha Hardee and Lynn Mulligan presented The Case of Loneliness in Older Adults
  - o Carol Moriarty presented Social Determinants of Health as an Education Vehicle
- The College took first place in the Community College Architecture program competitions, and our students took first place in the National Design Competition.
- The College also won an IDEAS grant for \$35,000, and recipients will go to South Africa and India.
- Trustee Epps asked how trips abroad are funded. Dr. Marshall informed him that grants and professional development funds are used to support faculty, travel, and presentation work.

The meeting adjourned.