

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, November 2, 2023
1:00 p.m.**

**Zoom
&
Career and Advanced Technology Center
4750 Market Street, Room 357
Philadelphia, PA 19139**

Presiding: Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend

**Committee
Members:** Ms. Mindy Posoff, Mr. Patrick Clancy, Ms. Roz McPherson, State
Representative Morgan Cephas

**Board
Participants:** Mr. Harold Epps

**College
Members:** Dr. Donald Generals, Dr. Alycia Marshall, Dr. Vance Gray,
Dr. Mellissia Zanjani, Dr. David Thomas, Danielle Liautaud-Watkins,
Dr. Shannon Rooney, Dr. Darren Lipscomb, Dr. Sesime Adanu

Guests: Dr. Judith Gay, Consultant to the Board of Trustees
Dr. Lisa Sanders, Dean of Liberal Studies
David Bertram, RA, Department Chair, Architecture, Design & Construction
Dr. Amy Birge - Caracappa, Director of Assessment
Lizzie Gordon, Assessment and Evaluation Coordinator
Kara Crombie, Department Head, Photographic Imaging
Ariel Vazquez, Architecture, Design and Construction Coordinator

I. Public Session

a) Introductions (I)

All guests were introduced. Trustee Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend called the meeting to order and referenced the October 5th, 2023, meeting minutes and materials that were shared with the Board in advance. Next, she brought to the floor a motion to approve the minutes from the last meeting. Trustee Mindy Epps made a motion to approve, and Trustee Patrick Clancy seconded the motion. The minutes from the October 5th meeting were approved.

(b) Architecture Associate of Arts Program (A)

Dr. Marshall congratulated and introduced Dr. Lisa Sanders who is the new Dean of Liberal Studies. Joining her was David Bertram who is the Department Head of both the Architecture Associate of Arts, and the Interior Design Associate of Arts programs. Other guests included Ariel Vazquez, the Architecture, Design and Construction Coordinator, Dr. Amy Birge - Caracappa, the Director of Assessment, and Elizabeth Gordon, the Assessment and Evaluation Coordinator.

Dr. Sanders began the discussion by highlighting some of the key findings of the architecture programs. Such findings included growth in enrollment, and the development of strategies to achieve equity goals by providing first year students with more time in the design studio space as an effort to help them to achieve their learning outcomes. The curriculum of the first two years in the program of has been designed to mirror the programs of four-year colleges. Dr. Sanders explained that the curriculum meets the five-year requirements necessary to become a licensed architect. To ensure that the program is aligned with the expectation of our transfer institutions, the program courses and additive courses have been revised, and annual assessments of every course have also been conducted.

Dr. Birge - Caracappa explained the enrollment data presented in the Architecture APR. She informed the Board that the program has strong enrollment and retention. The program has bounced back since the pandemic, which had previously decreased before and during that time. However, there is a disconnect between the enrollment increases and the number of students who graduate. There is also a disconnect between the number of students who transfer and graduate from their transfer institution. She stated that the reason for the disconnect should be investigated. Dr. Birge - Caracappa then elaborated on the key findings regarding the enrollment from the period of 2019 to 2023, which increased by 168.9%. In Fall 2018, retention decreased, but in Fall 2021 retention numbers bounced back up.

Dr. Marshall asked David Bertram to share strategies that address the graduation rate. He stated that some students are anxious to move on to the university, and may be off cycle when the semester ends and will begin. This may be a result of the current program schedule of courses. Although the students are great candidates for completing the Associate degree at CCP, some students prefer to leave early because they don't want to have a lapse of time between semesters or are simply anxious to start taking classes at a four-year institution. He explained that one way to resolve the lapse in time between semesters when transferring could be done by restructuring the studio scheduling with an additional studio in the summer to help those who start in the Spring complete. Dr. Sanders stated that studio classes are critical because it defines the students' commitment to becoming architects. These courses are required, and if students don't enroll in the courses, they are unable to complete the program. Mr. Bertram explained that students who don't complete the program may enroll in facility management, or construction management.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend raised a question highlighting two observations mentioned earlier during the presentation from the APR. The first question was related to the proportion of graduates who are completing the program less than the college average. She asked for clarity about whether the concept of transfer students is considered a bad thing, and if there was a way to have the data depict the meaning of transfer students more clearly. She also asked for confirmation regarding whether transfer students are achieving their degree. Mr. Bertram referred to Dr. Birge - Caracappa. Ms. Gordon informed the Board that the college receives a data package from the National Student Clearinghouse annually that consists of information from transfer institutions regarding what colleges students transferred to and whether those students actually graduated over the last five to seven years.

Trustee Epps asked if students taking a semester off when transferring is a detrimental decision that can cause financial debt which may essentially deter the student from completing their degree. He also asked if students who need to take off during the transfer period could intern, or participate in a learning co-op opportunity. Mr. Bertram shared with the Board that he does not have experience with internship models in his department, but would be interested in learning more about how it is structured in the college. He then referred to Ariel Vazquez, who is the Architecture, Design and Construction Coordinator who has a professional network that could be resourceful in helping to develop the opportunities referred to by Trustee Epps. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend followed up on her previous question with regards to data that reports the low graduation rate within the program. She inquired if feedback was provided by transfer institutions regarding student readiness. With regards to the low proportion of degrees being awarded, and the unsuccessful transfer rate, Trustee Fulmore-Townsend inquired about how successful students are when they move forward. Dr. Gray shared with the Board that the college has begun working with transfer partners and gathering data on how the college's students are doing once they transfer. From that data, he has been informed that the college's largest transfer partner, Temple University, is still only graduating our students at a 50% rate. He stated that he would touch base with Victoria Zellers to help us develop a new data sharing agreement that would be incorporated within the college's dual admission agreements allowing us to receive follow up information from transfer partners to gather data on how our students are doing in their first year after transferring. Trustee Epps asked if our graduation rates are higher for transfer students in other disciplines. Dr. Gray stated that both Dr. Birge – Caracappa and Ms. Gordon could provide specific insight to his question.

Dr. Gray informed the Board that he and Dr. Marshall were working on a strategy for reverse transfer of students. This would allow students who have since transferred from CCP to receive an associate's degree even after they have transferred as long as they meet the requirements. Many students simply transfer and are only concerned with getting the bachelor's degree and do not officially apply for graduation from CCP. A targeted approach to reaching out to these students could positively impact our graduation rates. The model will strengthen

the partnership with the college's transfer institutions, and provide a clearer understanding to students who do not receive a degree initially, while providing next steps following their studies. Trustee Posoff confirmed the meaning by asking if a student transfers from another college and doesn't finish at the transfer institution, if the student can transfer their credits at CCP.

Dr. Generals explained to the Board that the practice of reverse transferring is fairly common, and not exercised as much as it should. Trustee Posoff stated that students should know that reverse transferring is an option if they are struggling with their studies. Dr. Generals explained that there are caveats in the articulation agreements of what students should complete before progressing to the next level. Overall, students are fully aware that the best path academically and financially is to complete the degree program at CCP, and then pursue a bachelor's degree.

Trustee Posoff asked Mr. Bertram about the reason for the transition of classes from the spring into the summer timeframe. Mr. Bertram explained that it would be best for the students who start their studies off cycle because they are given the opportunity to finish in a shorter period of time and can begin working in the field sooner. Studio classes are intensive, four credit classes. With these classes, students work 16 to 18 hours a week, during the summer but complete the classes in a short timeframe.

Trustee Epps stated that he was having difficulty understanding the graduation success rates of CCP in general as it relates to the college's transferring partners. He inquired about what the three-year to five-year graduation rate is in general. Dr. Rooney informed the Board that she will follow up with the Director of Institutional Research to pull up that information.

Trustee Cephas asked how often the college examines whether the curriculum of the institutions where students are transferring to is aligned with what students are learning, and what is being done to ensure students feel prepared to matriculate into those institutions where they are enrolling? Dr. Marshall stated that examining that part of the transfer process is an ongoing process. The faculty, department heads, and the leadership teams review the curriculums on a regular basis. Mr. Bertram confirmed that he reviews the architecture and interior design curriculums. He also informed that Board that he and Mr. Vazquez both invite the program directors from Jefferson, Drexel, and Temple University for Advisory Board meetings to discuss the curriculum at CCP. Trustee Cephas asked if the program coordinators from those colleges have weighed in to share why CCP students are not as successful as we want them to be when they transfer into their institutions. Mr. Bertram stated that he has not been hearing that Architecture Associate of Arts students aren't succeeding based on his anecdotal conversations with CCP students who have transferred.

Mr. Vazquez stated that he and Mr. Bertram are constantly in discussion with transfer institutions regarding what is being taught in effort to align the college's curriculum closer to what the other institutions are doing so that our students can

successfully transfer to a three-year or four-year program. One program that is making changes is Jefferson. The university has made small changes in their Interior Design program that Mr. Vazquez is reviewing, so that CCP can continue to align their program to better prepare students for transfer. For instance, one class was an elective, but now transfers as meeting the requirements for two courses at Jefferson. Mr. Vazquez stated that the students at CCP are getting a good foundation.

Trustee McPherson made a suggestion to the Board and guests to consider partnering with HBCU's such as Hampton University in Virginia, which has a strong architecture program. Many of Hampton's architecture students continue their studies at schools such as Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT). Providing CCP students with opportunities at HBCU's outside of Philadelphia would be conducive to students providing them a nurturing environment that would help to develop their confidence. Mr. Vazquez agreed, and informed the Board that he had a similar discussion with Mr. Bertram with regards to students who would want to further their education outside of the Philadelphia area. He has been in contact with institutions that are interested in diversifying their student population such as the Illinois Institute of Technology (IIT), Kansas University, and the University of Michigan. Trustee McPherson replied that she would like for CCP students to be encouraged to consider having an HBCU experience because they will not encounter the same cultural experience if attending Kansas University or University of Michigan. Dr. Generals shared with the Board that a college fair was held on campus recently that was dedicated to HBCU institutions. Some of the institutions in attendance were Howard University, Lincoln University, Cheyney University, and Alabama A&M. In the meeting chat, Dr. Darren Lipscomb shared that advocacy for expanded enrollment at HBCUs, particularly those out of state, will require a willingness from those institutions to partner with us on creating scholarships for CCP graduates as cost can be a significant barrier for enrollment at those institutions.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked Mr. Bertram if there were any other updates he wanted to share with the Board. He shared that increased lab and open studio space has been provided for students that gives them access to software, materials, and equipment for their studies. Mr. Bertram shared that Jefferson University is one of the most gracious university transfer partners for the Architecture Associate of Arts in the area. However, Temple University does not accept a lot of CCP students' credits, and often makes them repeat courses. Drexel University is often too expensive for students to attend. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked Dr. Birge – Caracappa to share the Architecture program demographics chart on race and gender in the meeting chat on Zoom.

(c) Interior Design Associate in Arts Program (A)

Dr. Sanders opened the discussion regarding the Interior Design Associate of Arts Program by stating there are a few overlaps in the program that are similar to the Architecture Associate of Arts Program such as enrollment growth. First year students are provided the same opportunity as Architecture students are

within the same space. Jobs are projected to grow 1% due to the demand for environmentally friendly and accessible home and office interiors. One of the differences between the two programs is that licensing is not required for interior design, which allows students to begin practicing their craft right away without prolonging their studies. Dr. Birge – Caracappa explained that the data for the Interior Design program is similar to the Architecture program, however there are variations related to gender possibly due to gender norms typically associated with the different careers. Another factor might be related to the different requirements for employment that come with interior design. Although the program is smaller compared to Architecture, the enrollment increased by 346.7% from 15 students to 67 students in the period from 2019 to 2023. There was a lower proportion of students identifying as people of color than the college at 63.3%, as opposed to 77.6%. Within the program, there was a higher proportion of students identifying as white females. From 2018 through 2020, there was a steady increase in retention. Afterwards, there has been a decrease, with slight fluctuation over the years. The number of graduates has also been fluctuating. Dr. Birge – Caracappa stated that all other data has been similar to what was reported for the Architecture program.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked about how transfer data is reported regarding the success of students. Mr. Bertram explained students are ready to succeed after they complete studio four, and that there is no reason they should not succeed at a university. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked if there was a timing issue. Mr. Bertram stated that he has not noticed an issue and that the program is growing in enrollment.

Trustee McPherson shared that Architecture and Interior Design are two fields that can be challenging for people of color to enter, and that women can have a difficult time working within the field. She asked how is the discussion around culture and work culture shared in regards to both fields? Such challenges should be explained to students because they often are derailed from these interests because of the culture of the work environment.

Trustee Epps stated that it could be a good idea to bring in speakers who could share the realities of how it is working in the Architecture and Interior Design fields. Mr. Bertram agreed and informed the Board that Mr. Vazquez just hired a new colleague named Karen Anderson who is involved with the National Organization of Minority Architects (NOMA). Trustee Epps stated that there is at least a half dozen of different architectural and design firms that are owned by women and people of color that could potentially form a collaboration or partnership with the college on behalf of the students. Mr. Bertram shared that one of the courses that focuses on the history of architecture involves trips to New York City, and around the Philadelphia area that highlights the development of historical buildings. Trustee McPherson shared that the new African American Museum will be up on the parkway. There are some opportunities to observe not only the construction, but also interpretive design. There are Black firms that are involved in the project. There is also a Zion

Baptist Church redevelopment project taking place. The historic church was designed by an African American architect named Walter Livingston. Trustee McPherson would like to have students involved in legacy projects that could make a difference. Dr. General mentioned the Taney project and its historical significance. Taney street was named after Roger B. Taney, the Chief Supreme Court Justice in the Dred Scott v. Sanford case. The Supreme Court ruled that currently and formerly enslaved people were not American citizens. Dr. General recently held a fireside chat about the street's historical significance and the need to rename the street.

As the discussion came to a close regarding the Interior Design Associate of Arts Program, Dr. Birge – Caracappa informed the Board that she would follow up with regards to student success at the transfer institutions. Dr. Gray added that every institution's graduation rate where CCP sends students is tracked. Aggregated data is available, and now the college is working on getting it to a point where disaggregated student data is available for this population of students and at a program level. An agreement will need to be developed by Victoria Zellers as an effort to receive that information from partner institutions. Dr. General shared that periodically, a college president from institutions such as Drexel University and St. Joseph's University will send him the results of CCP students who have transferred there.

As the APR presentation closed, Trustee McPherson stated that due to the political climate of certain colleges in various states, there should be careful consideration of where students are encouraged to study.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend opened the floor to the Board to discuss the recommendation of both the Architecture and Interior Design programs. She expressed her concern regarding the graduation rates. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend would like the College to further examine the reasons for the low graduation rate, and consider if the resources allocated to the program and similar programs for retention and completion are enough. Dr. Marshall stated that there needs to be both an internal and external data conversation at CCP. The data that is typically shared for these presentations are based on external regulatory data requirements but don't always speak to how the data actually plays out with specific programs and populations of students. These nuances provide necessary context to fully understand the data and the implications. She shared that her insight with regards to the APRs is the need to look into expanding our reverse transfer efforts which would possibly increase the graduation numbers. Currently, there may be many students who are not counted in our graduation numbers even though they may have met the requirements. We would be able to include more of them moving forward if they take advantage of reverse transfer. Dr. Marshall would also like to dig into the transfer data further to find out more about how our students are doing in these fields once they transfer. Trustee McPherson expressed that the professors should be aware of the issues students face culturally. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend expressed concern that the Department Head was not aware of the

data shared from the APRs during the presentation. She further stated that she did not feel that the Board received a substantial response regarding the low graduation rate, and whether students are attending four-year institutions prematurely, underprepared and not supported. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend stated that she is not comfortable making the recommendation to approve these programs for five years at this time. Dr. Marshall shared that the data regarding transfer students needs to be examined. She would like to look into students who change their majors as well. Dr. Marshall also shared with the Board the efforts that are being taken to diversify faculty which can also help with sensitivity to the issues of culture. Trustee McPherson shared that a step should be taken further beyond hiring diverse faculty and that cultural competency should be a factor as well. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked Dr. Rooney how soon would it be before a conversation takes place regarding the research. Dr. Rooney assured her that the information could be provided soon. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked if the research could be discussed at the next SOC meeting in January. Trustee Clancy asked about the ramifications if a decision was not made during the meeting to approve the programs because he thinks it's best to not make a decision that could have a negative impact, and inquired about the timeline.

Dr. Marshall stated that the Board should also consider the implications of not approving the program, which has doubled in enrollment since Covid, and consider the overall approach that has been taken to date to approve or not approve a program. Although there is data that needs to be gathered and considered further, in the next meeting a decision can be made about approving or not approving for a certain period of time less than the typical five years to allow the department to make progress towards improving the graduation rates. Trustee McPherson expressed that she is not suggesting not to approve, but that more conversation is needed around the challenges of both programs. Trustee Fulmore-Townsend shared that in the past when the Board has had concerns about a program, goals were specified around enrollment, or graduation, or assessment.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend concluded the meeting by stating that the hiring updates would be discussed at the next meeting. Both Dr. Marshall and Dr. Rooney will clarify the data and research questions and make sure the Board has information. The discussion about the Board's recommendation for both of these programs will continue at the next meeting.