

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, October 5, 2023

1:00 p.m.

Hybrid

Zoom

&

Library Learning Commons, L1-13

1700 Spring Garden Street

Philadelphia, PA 19130

Presiding: Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend

Committee Members: Ms. Sheila Ireland, Ms. Roz McPherson, Mr. Tyrell McCoy

Board Participants: Mr. Harold Epps

College Members: Dr. Donald Generals, Dr. Alycia Marshall, Dr. Mellissia Zanjani, Dr. David Thomas, Danielle Liautaud-Watkins,

Guests: Dr. Linda Powell, Special Assistant to the Provost and Vice President for STEM Outreach and Engagement/Project Director/ Professor-Department of Biology
Dr. Karen Rege, Dean of Online Learning & Media Services
Dr. Judith Gay, Consultant to the Board of Trustees

(I.) Public Session

(a) Introductions (I)

Trustee Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend called the meeting to order and referenced the September 7th, 2023, meeting minutes and materials that were shared with the Board in advance. She inferred that a timeline be established of when minutes are reviewed and approved for Student Outcome Committee meetings going forward. Next, she brought to the floor a motion to approve the minutes from the last meeting. Sheila Ireland seconded the motion. The minutes from the September 7th meeting were approved.

(b) STEM Honors Update (I)

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend turned the meeting to Dr. Marshall who began the discussion by recalling a previous Student Outcomes Committee meeting where

the Academic and Student Success division's goals were presented to include a goal around providing equitable access to challenging academic opportunities for all students. In addition, a discussion of last year's Liberal Arts Honors APR including increasing access to honors to students outside of Liberal Arts and developing a STEM Honors program. She introduced Dr. Linda Powell to share an update on the progress of the STEM Honors program as well as current and future STEM projects to increase the number of opportunities for students to have equitable access to challenging intellectual and creative co-curricular experiences.

On the opening slide, Dr. Powell pointed out the number of students that filled each biology lab and classroom, and shared student demographics that the STEM Honors program could impact including their average grade point average. From Fall 2022 through Spring 2023, the grade point average in both Biology and Chemistry is 3.2, and for Computer Science and Information Systems, the grade point average is 2.3. Based on the data available, Dr. Powell shared there were 192 students who were STEM Scholars/STEM Honors eligible for Fall 2022 and 193 students eligible for Spring 2023.

Dr. Powell shared that the STEM Honors and the STEM Scholars programs will be separate, two-tiered programs. The programs participants will be diverse, including traditional, college-age students and those who may already have bachelor's degrees and are attending CCP to gain further knowledge and skills. Her plan is for the College to offer opportunities that will help STEM Honor students excel as they move through the College's associate degree programs, and into graduate and professional study. Dr. Powell expounded on STEM Program specifics and shared that students are going to accumulate letters of support certificates on a portfolio-based program called Backpack. Points accumulated in STEM Scholars will count toward the STEM Honors program if they meet the appropriate grade point average requirements. Following that, students will be moved to the entry point of an online site where they will be able to fill out an interest form. The database will notify the student about specific programming related to their disciplinary interests. Their grade point average will have to be a 3.0 when petitioning for STEM HONORS.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked, if students can participate in STEM Honor activities without the designation. Dr. Powell informed her that students can participate in information sessions and presentations but if the actual activity requires specific course work or a minimum GPA then, only that population can pursue it. For example, The Children's Hospital research requires completion of specific courses in Biology and Chemistry as well as a 3.2 GPA.

Penn Mechano-Biology is open to Engineering and Biology students who completed specific courses and achieved a certain GPA. All students can come to the information session but only those meeting the criteria can apply.

Students can apply through a website or in person to receive information. They

will need to have a faculty member or the Special Assistant to the Provost request to complete the dynamic form for the STEM Honors or STEM Scholars designation after they have fulfilled the required components. At a specified time in the semester, a faculty review committee will look over the submitted data to determine whether the students should receive STEM Scholars or Honors designation. Based on their recommendation, the dynamic form will be completed so they can receive STEM Honors or STEM Scholars on their transcript.

For the STEM Scholars program, the students are going to have to maintain that grade point average to keep the designation every semester. Students are required to have a 3.0 when they come into the program to acquire a STEM Scholars designation. However, some students might prefer not to participate in the STEM Honors program because they don't want to complete the required number of participations in STEM related activities. If students apply to the STEM Honors program, they must reach a 3.2 grade point average, have English 101 placement, and receive a sign off by coordinating faculty.

Students must have a 3.0 grade point average who are interested in STEM Scholars and complete either a service-learning project, academic research, special assignments, or a presentation and attend at least two in-person department, division, or pathway grant functions. This semester, there are between 15 to 20 different STEM related activities students can participate in that spans a variety of disciplines such as biology, chemistry, engineering, and computer science. If students move on to STEM Honors, they must maintain a 3.2 or above, have at least two poster presentations, special assignments, or academic research projects over two different STEM majors' courses. For instance, with an Honors entry level, one class is sufficient. A STEM Scholars criterion for a student must have two pathway/divisional participations and one research/special assignment/service-learning project and a 3.0+ GPA. For STEM Honors they need three pathway/divisional participations and two research/special assignment/service-learning projects and a 3.2+ GPA. These activities are not necessarily in a specific class or classes. They can be at an off-campus or government organization.

Dr. Powell provided insight regarding the merit of student work. Students are expected to display the acquisition of grades to support that they have developed critical analysis skills. The students are required to present an abstract hypothesis or thesis that is at the level of what would be presented at an academic research symposium. The work must be at a level demonstrating critical analysis, understanding of the topics and rigor to justify the work is honor's level. If students are math majors, they are required to include analytical computation with mathematical analysis, show interpretation of their data and show a competency of the understanding of their outcomes and solutions. Dr. Powell discussed oral presentations and posters for the fall and spring semesters which will enable students to have multiple opportunities to present and display their work. The presentation for review may be a published paper, poster, PowerPoint or oral presentation with data. For example, there are Community College of Philadelphia students participating in a symposium for academic research that they completed at the University of Penn, or the Annual Biomedical Research

Conference for Minoritized Scientists. For the STEM Scholars and STEM Honors students, their science club participation will also count as participation towards the designation.

Dr. Powell also shared with the Board a listing of activities, industries and events that senior research scientists, doctors, and pharmacists who are among the Community College of Philadelphia alumni are involved in such as the Penn Pathway Alumni Speaker Series. She also informed the Board of a new program that involves the St. Mary's Medical Center's residents, and the residents of Philadelphia College of Osteopathic Medicine. These residents are going to adopt CCP students and mentor them through medical school admission. We also have Community College of Philadelphia students who go to Brookhaven National Labs and participate in their research. Our students are also participating in the Children's Hospital summer research program at the Center for Translational Medicine. The University of Penn has also had a long-standing relationship with the Community College of Philadelphia. They hold a certain number of slots in their research programs for our students every year. Dr. Powell explained that through the College's programs, her goal is for CCP STEM Honors students to be associated with high quality learning from one of the most rigorous programs in this city. In laying the foundation for the STEM Scholars and STEM Honors programs, Dr. Powell informed the Board that she has sent students to Google hackathons through AMP and some have placed / won prizes pre-pandemic. There is an opportunity for more students to go to hackathons from CCP. The Discovery Center is another new programming relationship where the College's students are doing academic research in conjunction with the Audubon Society. Dr. Powell then opened the floor for questions.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked how we were able to develop the STEM Honors program so quickly after it was only discussed in concept during the spring semester. Dr. Powell explained that the College's Guided Pathways structure allows all the Department Heads, and Program Coordinators to work together to honestly assess what students and faculty both need. She also shared that her 28-year grant relationships throughout the city and her affiliation with the National Science Foundation and the National Academy of Sciences contributed to being able to develop the program quickly.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked Dr. Marshall if there are other opportunities for accelerated progress and structure like the progress of STEM Honors. Dr. Marshall credited the framing and communication related to the Division's goals and priorities which support the development of objectives and action items to accelerate the work. Additionally, since faculty and staff themselves are developing the objectives and action items, there is already a level of buy-in, urgency and an understanding of common goals in support of innovative practices to positively impact student success.

Trustee Epps complimented Dr. Powell on her presentation. He reflected on the specific demographics and historic reputation of the country whereas women, and people of color often don't matriculate in large numbers through STEM pathways.

He stated that collectively, we should work to ensure broad participation of students of color in the STEM Honors programs. Trustee Epps referenced a conversation he had with Trustee Jeremiah White that our college should be a first choice for low-income, first-generation students in the sciences because of our low-cost tuition and high-quality programs. He suggested that from a Marketing and Public Relations perspective, perhaps a Hall of Fame program could be created that would consist of graduates who could bring visibility of what's possible when you start at the Community College of Philadelphia. Dr. Powell agreed and informed the Board of a senior research scientist named Andre Marc Pierre Loue, who works for Corning Glass in Corning, New York. He began his studies in the remedial math program at the Community College of Philadelphia and continued to pursue both his undergraduate and doctorate degrees at Temple University. He is now on the science research leadership team at Corning Glass. Dr. Powell also shared information about another former student named Tamika Wilson who is a Senior Analyst for the supply chain at Campbell's Soup. Tamika talked to students as an Alumni of the Year two years ago. Dr. Powell stated that she would be willing to provide the names of alumni who have an interest in engagement with the college. Trustee Epps suggested that alumni such as those named by Dr. Powell possibly have their own branded scholarship. He stated that companies are giving major institutions hundreds of thousands of dollars a year in scholarships. To acquire these funds, we must start making the case why the Community College of Philadelphia is deserving of such funds. Both Trustees Epps and McPherson stated that multiple opportunities to market alumni is needed, and that corporate newsletters could also promote and highlight the Community College of Philadelphia alumni, which could be cross promoted as a strategic marketing campaign focusing on STEM. Trustee McPherson shared she would like to make sure young people have a clear understanding of the multitude of jobs that exist in the STEM field. Trustee McPherson also shared with Dr. Powell that she would like to connect her with Deborah Crabb, an African American cardiologist and research scientist specializing in women's health who is resourceful in terms of acquiring grants.

Dr. General asked Dr. Powell to describe in more detail the AMP program. Dr. Powell explained to the Board the Louis Stokes Alliance for Minority Participation, named after Louis Stokes, is referred to as the AMP program. African American, Latino and Native American students who are high performing are eligible. Most of the students within the program for the academic year of 2022-2023 had an average grade point average of 3.2 and needed to meet that average GPA to receive a grant. However, a student can come into the AMP program with a 2.0, and students with a 2.5 are able to receive book stipends. Dr. Powell explained that students need to understand that they have to have something to aim for in various types of careers. As they study with students who are academically stronger, they see and learn behavioral patterns of success.

Dr. Marshall concluded the STEM Honors program discussion and stated that the program is an example of how the Academic and Student Success division is

working to develop very targeted programming, and to promote that the Community College of Philadelphia is truly a destination for high-achieving students. She transitioned to the next update on HyFlex and the alignment with the Academic and Student Success division strategic plan. HyFlex is an example of something the college has implemented that supports our efforts to increase the college's graduation rates while eliminating racial equity gaps.

(c) HyFlex Update

(I)

Dr. Marshall introduced Dr. Karen Rege, the Dean of Online Learning and Multimedia Services to talk about the CCP's new HyFlex modality. Dr. Karen Rege opened her discussion by explaining to the Board the meaning of HyFlex. The HyFlex instructional method is a hybrid flexible course format that combines a face-to-face (F2F) and online learning instructional format. Each class session is offered in-person, synchronously online, and asynchronously online. At any given point while enrolled in the course, students can decide how to participate. They can choose to come to class one day, or sign in using Zoom the next day. This learning format provides them with flexibility beyond the traditional online or in-person class. Dr. Rege shared the current classes that are offering the HyFlex modality option. There were two outfitted HyFlex classrooms in use as a test pilot for three classes for the Spring 2023 semester: Biology 109 in NERC, Mathematics 161 in room BR 22, and Nutrition 111 in NERC.

Trustee McPherson asked Dr. Rege for clarity on the number of students reflected in each classroom. Dr. Rege informed the Board that there were 36 students in BIO 109, 4 students in NUTR 111, and 36 students in MATH 161. Dr. Rege continued by sharing survey feedback from students with the Board that was taken during the beginning of the pilot and as an exit survey at the conclusion of the course. Some of the feedback highlighted the ease of work life balance, the ability to be flexible to manage childcare needs, and the ability to manage transportation costs to campus. Many of the students also liked that class materials can be reviewed during their own time. Dr. Rege shared that 86% of the students surveyed would take a HyFlex class again.

Dr. Rege discussed the student's attendance pattern of the HyFlex modality from two weekly class sessions of the Spring 2023 semester. Clark Loveridge, a math professor, calculated HyFlex students and how they participated in every class session. One of the results highlighted showed how many of the students who started out in-person shifted to taking the course online by the end of the semester. Dr. Rege then reviewed the success rates of the pilot courses and found that overall, 78% of students passed the class and had a higher pass rate in the HyFlex modality compared to the students taking the same courses in-person. Trustee Epps asked how students who drop classes are captured. Dr. Rege explained that withdrawals and data from the Nutrition and Biology classes were not captured on the report. However, Professor Loveridge did inform her that he

had three withdrawals from his math course, which is less than he has had in previous semesters. Trustee McPherson asked if a student's preference can be determined, and which learning method is best. For example, what type of student would learn best through independent study, taking the class in an online format, versus in-person. She also asked whether Language Arts or courses from other disciplines were used in the pilot. Dr. Rege informed the Board that there are 10-12 pilot sections running this semester in other subject areas across all three academic divisions and there were faculty who volunteered upfront. At the end of this semester, we will have more information on how this modality is doing in a larger variety of courses and disciplines.

Dr. Marshall added that the division has seen a significant difference in attendance as a result of the HyFlex modality and that there appears to be a positive relationship between attendance, student engagement, and course completion. With HyFlex students now having an option to attend asynchronously, many students have remained in classes where they might have otherwise dropped out. The flexibility offered does have a positive impact on retention, attendance, and possibly on final grades. Trustee McPherson asked if teacher effectiveness was being measured, or just the effectiveness of students. Dr. Marshall informed her that teaching effectiveness in this modality has not been measured yet, however, Dr. Rege is working on quality control in not only Hyflex courses, but all online courses. Trustee McPherson asked if they were seeing more effective pedagogy through the outcomes tested. Dr. Marshall informed her that the faculty are self-selecting and typically are those who want to try something new. These faculty tend to be high-achieving and committed to completing the required training for successful implementation of this modality. Dr. Rege stated that another important factor considered in the survey was making sure students understood the meaning of a HyFlex class, and if they had initial technology challenges, or needed additional support. The students were also asked how the HyFlex option affected their ability to learn in the course. Overall, the results have been very positive.

Trustee Epps asked if the survey results shared included dual enrollment students. Dr. Rege informed him that she would have to go back and disaggregate the data to identify dual enrollment students. Dr. David Thomas replied to both Trustee Epps and Dr. Rege to inform the Board that his department will look at the classes to see if there were any dual enrollment students enrolled in pilot courses. However, the courses used in the pilot were not traditionally dual enrollment courses because students often choose courses that would meet their high school graduation requirement. They also tend to prefer in-person classes so that they can come to campus and have more of a college experience. Trustee Epps suggested that as the College reaches out to younger students, they are bound to be a part of the equation. Dr. Thomas explained that traditionally, dual enrollment students are expected and required to go to face to face classes for various reasons. Both their parents and their principals want to know where students are during class. However, this year, the College has expanded partnerships with a lot of the cyber

charter schools that exist both in Philadelphia and across the Commonwealth. The cyber charter school students would be ideal for a HyFlex course offering and modality. Dr. Thomas stated he would meet with Dr. Rege and her team to discuss pilot options.

Dr. Rege continued her presentation by highlighting the first survey that resulted in about 86% of the students stating they would enroll in HyFlex again. The survey found that 33% of the students enrolled this semester purposefully selected another HyFlex course. The students surveyed either had taken a HyFlex course previously, or they were told about the course from other students or their advisors.

For the Fall semester, the HyFlex courses that were added included Foundational Math, Calculus, Business, several English courses, Interpersonal Communications, Family Relationship Counseling, and Allied Health. This spring, there will be more HyFlex courses offered. Dr. Rege revisited a point made by Dr. Marshall with regards to training. She informed the Board that in her conversations with several other institutions in the area and around the country, she learned that some of the biggest challenges have been not getting the courses to run successfully due to the inadequate training of faculty. To prepare to teach Hyflex at CCP, the faculty attend a 10-hour asynchronous training course prior to teaching in the pilot. HyFlex Application Labs provided an opportunity for faculty to practice teaching the HyFlex modality in person and utilizing the camera features for students who participate on Zoom. The Hyflex faculty share resources and information from their experiences and what they are learning with each other in a support group/learning community. The faculty have also started a book club. Some faculty teaching HyFlex courses are reading an online book that's free and openly licensed by Brian Beatty, who teaches at the University of San Francisco. He is one of the pioneers of HyFlex. Our College has also had a faculty guest speaker from Kent State University, Dr. Wendy Teats, who's been sharing her best practices in HyFlex. Her visit to the campus was sponsored by the Faculty Center for Teaching and Learning (FCTL) and supported by Title III funding. Trustee McPherson asked if technical assistance is available during class sessions if needed. Dr. Rege informed the Board that wraparound support is provided to faculty during sessions. There are also resource manuals for the technology in the classroom so that the faculty have a guide to troubleshoot. Phone numbers are available to call if they need assistance right away.

Dr. Rege explained that a six-minute video has been created to teach students about how to participate in a HyFlex course, and what to expect in the class. There have been some challenges however, around audio issues in these classes. To fix the issues, consultants were brought in to review all the classrooms. There are currently seven classrooms that are designated for HyFlex and there are two more that will be built this academic year. Due to HyFlex being in the pilot phase, the marketing and communications about HyFlex has not been shared broadly. There are still faculty and students who are not aware of HyFlex. Information

about HyFlex will need to be connected in the information systems for when the students look for courses. They will need to be labeled in the data dashboards. The development team is working to create a scale up plan so that the resources needed for HyFlex are identified. Trustee McPherson stated that HyFlex modalities gives students an opportunity to play to their strengths in terms of how they best learn. Dr. Rege stated she is excited to see if the needle on the retention can be moved. Trustee Epps asked how we stack up with other community colleges who are using HyFlex. Dr. Rege informed the Board she will investigate regionally. There have been conversations with Montco where HyFlex has not been running successfully however, Finger Lakes Community College has 63 HyFlex courses up and running. Overall, HyFlex has been more widely adopted in the graduate school level than it has in the undergraduate and community college level. One of the biggest barriers that community colleges face related to developing HyFlex has been due to a lack of technology funding resources. Faculty training challenges are also a critical barrier that community colleges face with regards to having HyFlex modality success. We feel that with our extensive training opportunities and real-time support for faculty, CCP is well positioned to have a successful HyFlex pilot and full implementation leading to improved student learning outcomes.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend informed the Board that all meeting agenda items have been met and adjourned the meeting.