

Meeting Book - Student Outcomes Committee of the Board (Hybrid), October 5th at 1p.m.

Thursday, October 5, 2023 / 1:00 p.m. - 2:30 p.m.

(I) Public Session

(a) Introduction (I)

SOC Meeting Minutes 9.7 - Final (1) (1).docx

(b) STEM Honors Update (I)

*Guest: Dr. Linda Powell, Special Assistant to the  
Provost on STEM Outreach and Engagement*

(c) Hyflex Update (I)

*Guest: Dr. Karen Rege, Dean of Online Learning and  
Multimedia Services*

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE  
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Thursday, September 7, 2023**

**1:00 p.m.**

**Hybrid**

**Zoom**

**&**

**Library Learning Commons, L1-13**

**1700 Spring Garden Street**

**Philadelphia, PA 19130**

**Presiding:** Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend

**Committee Members:** Ms. Mindy Posoff, Mr. Patrick Clancy, Ms. Sheila Ireland, Ms. Roz McPherson

**Board Participants:** Mr. Harold Epps

**College Members:** Dr. Donald Generals, Dr. Alycia Marshall, Dr. Vance Gray, Dr. Mellissia Zanjani, Dr. David Thomas, Danielle Liautaud-Watkins

**Guests:** Dr. Judith Gay  
Dr. Lisa Sanders, Interim Dean of Liberal Studies  
Dr. Amy Birge - Caracappa, Director of Assessment  
Lizzie Gordon, Assessment and Evaluation Coordinator  
Kara Crombie, Department Head Photographic Imaging

**I. Public Session**

- a) Introductions (I)
- b) Photography Associate of Applied Science (A.A.S.) Academic Program Review (A)

Dr. Amy Birge - Caracappa, Director of Assessment, shared that the faculty meets every semester to review the Photographic Imaging department's data and analyze and discuss the planned next steps moving forward. Since the previous audit, the department faculty and staff has worked to improve the courses, and program learning outcomes alignment. Dr. Birge - Caracappa stated that the next recommended action item is to increase enrollment at a steady pace. She shared that enrollment could increase depending on the interventions that are planned.

Dr. Birge - Caracappa explained she had a chance to monitor the effects of 22 courses that were revised and how the effects of those revisions, along with the convening of a new Advisory Committee, will help to monitor program metrics and improvements. She also shared that the Photography (PHOT) program is an early adapter of Guided Pathways which underwent a significant revision in 2017, providing students with a more coherent pathway to completion. Some of the key enrollment and demographic findings highlighted during the meeting was a peak in Fall 2018 enrollment of 63 students, and the lowest enrollment numbers of 28 students in Spring 2021. Following the enrollment decrease in 2021, the headcount increased by 75% by Fall 2022 to 49 students. The proportions of PHOT program students in each category of academic standing, e.g., good standing, dropped, or probation, mirror those of the College overall. A lower proportion of PHOT graduates transferred to another institution (25.0%, or three of twelve+ students) than graduates of the College overall (58.2%). The PHOT program enrolled a higher proportion of students identifying as black males (16.3%) than did the college overall (12.8%), and a higher proportion of students identifying as males of color (37.6%) than the College's overall average of the same group (25.1%). On average, the program enrolled a smaller proportion of students identifying as female (53.1%) than did the College overall (66.1%).

Trustee McPherson inquired about whether the enrollment data shared referenced self-identified students in terms of gender within the Photography program. Dr. Birge – Carracapa informed her that the category in question has not been specifically tracked.

Trustee McPherson stated that there are a few potential partnership opportunities with organizations such as Visit Philadelphia. The Chief Marketing Officer, Neil Frauenglass would possibly be interested in seeing the work of the photography students. She also shared that there is a cultural resources survey for the city that will present how people define arts, history, and preservation in their own neighborhoods.

Dr. Marshall informed the Board that there is an ongoing internal conversation around how gender should be tracked. The APR's typically track using traditional gender categories which is consistent with external requirements. She intends on having a conversation with Dr. Rooney about tracking self-identifying related gender data.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked about how the Photography programs advisory committee was arranged. She inquired whether there were top expertise areas that were missing, and what some of the Photography department's needs are currently.

Ms. Kara Crombie, Department Head Photographic Imaging explained that the advisory committee consists of professionals working in the field at broadcast networks such as WHYY, and CBS Philly. Other collaborative relationships are with institutions such as the Made Eye Institute down the street. Photography

professionals on the advisory committee are also invited to critiques. At the end of the semester, there is a department critique where all the students come together and review work from other classes. This semester, in November there will be another meeting to address the emergence of AI in the field.

Trustee McPherson stated that Visit Philadelphia often contracts photographers which could potentially lead to internship opportunities for students.

Ms. Crombie shared information on a new course that is offered due to the curriculum revision, called *Community Photography Projects*, available for the first time this semester. For the class, students will work on a community project and design the career direction they want to pursue. For example, they can do projects in neighborhoods around the city which would allow them to gain professional experience, but also make connections between institutions and Philadelphia to do the projects.

Trustee Posoff asked a question regarding the assessments from 2013, and 2014 through 2023, which has been impacted by COVID, and how the program can be pushed further to stay on track with the changing technology in this field. Ms. Crombie informed the Board that the department is keeping up with technology software, and equipment, which is reviewed by an equipment manager, and the faculty, working professionals in the field and privy to industry trends. She further explained that a revised extensive curriculum was created to introduce five new courses, which includes a drone course.

Trustee Posoff asked about the marketing of the program. Ms. Crombie shared that the program has an Instagram page that shares what students are working on, and a Street Style book that features street style photography.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend referred to page six of the APR with a question. She requested an explanation about the group of students who have zero credit versus the group of those who have one to 24 credits. Ms. Lizzie Gordon, Assessment and Evaluation Coordinator, explained that the orange category highlighting one to 24 credits earned represents first-year students, and 25 plus represents sophomores in their second year.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked Dr. Marshall about her recommendations and perspective regarding the approval of the program. Dr. Marshall stated that she was impressed with the Photography program, and the curriculum revisions, as well as the increasing enrollment and retention. She recommended having the program approved for the next five years.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend made a motion to approve the photography program for the next five years. Trustee McPherson seconded. All other committee members were in favor. The vote was unanimous to approve the Photography program for another 5 years and will be on the consent agenda for the October meeting.

Dr. Marshall shared an update on the Academic and Student Success planning process currently being worked on while meeting the strategic plan's goals. While developing the plan, discussions were focused on divisional growth, and meeting the demands of students. She informed the Board of the leadership retreat in January at the Faith of Liberty Center. Following the retreat, there were 200-person division-wide planning sessions in April where the division was presented with the working vision and high-level priorities. Afterwards, the feedback from the division meeting was shared at the end of the academic year. The final divisional goals and priorities were officially shared with the entire division at the fall divisional meeting on August 29<sup>th</sup>. Individual departments are also developing their objectives and action items related to the divisional goals for Academic and Student Success. There are also student focus groups being conducted to find out what they would like the division to improve.

Dr. Marshall then highlighted a few of the divisional goals, and how the College's sixth pillar (Diversity, Equity and Inclusion) is integrated throughout the goals. She shared that her Aspen project featured a thorough review of CCP data by demographics which revealed the several alarming trends related to student success among students of color. Such findings revealed that African American students comprising 41% of the College's total student population is the lowest performing demographic at the College with lowest graduation and retention rates. The group also has the lowest rate of completion of Gateway math and English courses, and the lowest rates of transfer and completion of a bachelor's degree.

Overall, she expressed that the division is a community of learners, committed to student success through equitable and measurable outcomes, innovative practices, relevant curriculum, quality learning, and a rewarding student experience. Initiatives established to provide support for faculty and staff in meeting divisional goals includes anti-racist training, HyFlex training, and onboarding for faculty and department heads.

Dr. Marshall introduced Dr. Vance Gray to the Board to discuss one specific focus for improving student learning outcomes at the college. Dr. Gray began his part of the presentation by stating the importance of prioritizing career goal attainment to ensure that students are ready for the workforce. While achieving the goal of improving student engagement, he suggested considering whether students are provided the appropriate support services, and if those services are equitable. He went on to further provide insight regarding racial equity change efforts that have been done at the college to eliminate racial gaps. Community College of Philadelphia was selected as one of seven institutions to participate in achieving the dreams Racial Equity Leadership Academy - an achievement that builds on the last eight or nine years of work that Dr. General's has put into place towards equity and closing racial gaps. Dr. Gray highlighted the following data: The percentage of African American students, successfully completing their Math and English courses in their first year is only 15%, resulting in 85% of

students left behind who are either withdrawing or dropping out. The average total credits that are completed by African American students in a year is 6.3 credits, which is less than a part time rate. The average total number of credits that are attempted by African Americans, again, is still the lowest of all racial demographics. They are not completing many of the courses they are taking and the time they're spending at the institution is drastically increasing. The proposed racial equity change effort is based on building an environment where targeted interventions in teaching and learning leads to improved student success outcomes.

Trustee Ireland asked for clarity with regards to the timeframe for improvement. Dr. Marshall explained that the information presented is a proposed five-year plan and will be ongoing as the departments work on their objectives and their action items. Following that, the leadership team will look at all the objectives, the action items, and identify KPIs. Certain efforts which are anticipated to have a broad impact will be prioritized within the first few years.

Trustee Ireland asked Dr. Gray if he had data that could help the Board better understand why the gap exists regarding the attainment rates in math and reading. Dr. Gray suggested that data can be gathered, however it might be anecdotal due to the development cycle for math and English and interventions that have been recently implemented. He alluded to the lack of test preparation students have when preparing to attend CCP, which might lead to unfavorable results. He referred to co-requisite developmental models that other institutions may have started using, such as University System of Georgia or the Tennessee university system. He shared that some of the CCP students are stuck in cycles of developmental education that doesn't allow them to move forward. He believes that the racial equity change effort will help moving forward. Dr. Marshall shared her perspective as a former math professor and stated that African American students have historically been disproportionately placed in developmental mathematics courses and have been underrepresented in STEM fields as a result.

Trustee McPherson shared that children of color have typically been discouraged from pursuing studies in STEM fields. She asked Dr. Generals, if a lack of preparedness is an issue when a student graduates from high school. Dr. Generals stated that the level of remediation continues to be off the charts. Nationwide, it's about 60% of students who come out of public schools, it's even more condensed in the city of Philadelphia. We tend to shy away from the math and sciences, however, Middle Eastern and African students come to the country seemingly far more advanced. The pandemic has also caused students to be two or three grades behind in terms of math and English and increasingly placed in developmental courses.

Dr. Marshall added that one of the short-term interventions to help solve the problem regarding representation might be peer support, and peer tutoring. Students who do well in the class, could support other students in the same classes, which could help the student who is having a hard time. Students tend to

be more motivated when they see others that look like them who are also successful in a field such as mathematics.

Trustee Clancey asked if there was a breakdown of the age group of the individuals. Dr. Gray informed him that the data was based on all the students and believes that there are 50% adult learners. We will work with Institutional Research to provide the official data analysis. Dr. Shannon Rooney shared that Dr. Eric Shannon, who is the Director of Institutional Research is working on ways to disaggregate the data by age group.

Trustee Posoff asked if there were any roadblocks while creating the community within the division and what internal or external tools are needed to make the change. Dr. Marshall informed her that the term community of learners originated from feedback from the faculty and staff that attended the sessions. This was intentionally incorporated to create a vision that included the community of learners statement with the goal of fostering a sense of community among the faculty and staff within the division to work towards our common goals. The conversation has always been focused on what's best for students, which has been instrumental in gaining buy-in and a common purpose. In terms of the community piece, people are starting to feel a sense of belonging and commitment towards our goals.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend asked Dr. Marshall about the timeline of the divisional plan and goals. Dr. Marshall informed her that the objective items and action items of the plan will be fully fleshed out in October or November and the final comprehensive plan will be shared officially in the beginning of the spring semester.

Trustee McPherson expressed her sentiments regarding the emotional impacts when students are made to feel less than even when it's not supposedly intentional. Dr. General stated that basic skills, Accuplacer SATs, and GRE s were never intended to be a single factor in determining a person's abilities. Dr. Dave Thomas added that having observed various iterations of data through the years, he has noticed progress in various areas such as placement. Although we are not where we want to be, the college has made some progress in utilizing alternative methods of placement beyond high stakes testing such as high school grades and coursework. We can learn a lot when we look at the students who are successful. Dr. General agreed that deficit models should not always be observed, because if 60% are not doing well, there are 40% who are.

At the conclusion of the meeting, Trustee Posoff asked if the documents from the recent meeting can be placed on BoardEffect.