

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE  
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

**MINUTES**

**Thursday, June 15, 2023**

**10:00 a.m.**

**Hybrid**

**Zoom**

**&**

**Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1**

**1700 Spring Garden St.**

**Philadelphia, PA 19130**

**AGENDA**

**Presiding:** Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend

**Committee**

**Members:** Ms. Mindy Posoff, Ms. Rosalyn McPherson

**College**

**Members:** Dr. Donald Generals, Dr. Alycia Marshall, Dr. Vance Gray, Danielle Liautaud-Watkins, Dr. Judith Gay

**Guests:**

Dr. Lisa Sanders, Assistant Dean/Interim Dean of Liberal Studies, Dr. Myla Morris-Skeiker, English Department Chair and Associate Professor of English, Dr. Amy Birge-Caracappa, Director of Assessment, Elizabeth Gordon, Assessment and Evaluation Coordinator, David Raskin, Assistant Professor of Communication Studies and Mass Media, Curriculum Coordinator for Communication Studies and Mass Media programs

**(I.)     Public Session**

(a)       Introductions (I)

Trustee Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend called the meeting to order. An introduction of Dr. Lisa Sanders was made who was in attendance to lead the discussions of the academic program reviews for both the Mass Media Associate of Arts program and the Communications Studies Associate of Arts program.

(b)   Mass Media Associate of Arts (A.A.) Academic Program Review (A)

Dr. Lisa Sanders, the Acting Dean of Liberal Studies, began by noting a few statistics and key findings about the Mass Media program. She stated the average full-time enrollment of the Mass Media program is higher than the college average; however, enrollment in the program has decreased by 61.9%. Dr. Sanders shared that on average, the Black male

enrollment in the Mass Media program is greater than college-wide enrollment for this demographic. She noted that the proportion of students within the program between 16 to 21 years of age, is greater than that of the college overall. She continued by providing information about the retention findings among students within the Mass Media program. From the Fall 2017 to Spring 2022, 65.5% of students returned to the same program or graduated, while 64.6% of students college-wide returned to the same program or graduated. Dr. Sanders continued by sharing the Mass Media department's program responses from a prior audit and action items that were carried out. The first program audit response was related to the evaluation of articulation agreements. Many of the Mass Media articulation agreements are not utilized. Currently, there are 21 articulation agreements, thirteen of which were not used during the five-year period studied. Although the Mass Media program's largest partner institution is Temple University, the program does not have a fully executed articulation agreement with Temple University, even though several students from the program transferred to Temple over the five-year period of study. She stated that since the last audit, Temple's Communication programs have been restructured, however, the COVID-19 pandemic presented some challenges with following up with curricular alignments. Since then, the department has stayed abreast of the changes with intentions to align the curriculum and develop a formal articulation agreement in the near future.

Another audit response was related to improving retention with a focus on students earning less than twelve credits. Over a five-year time period, the Mass Media program enrolled on average 89 students a year. Of the students that enrolled in the program, 152 Mass Media students left the program and college, while only 25 of those students left the program with a degree. Dr. Sanders explained that the program update reflects several courses and programs the department has developed in recent years that are aimed in part, at recruiting and retaining new students. The English department re-designated the required ENGL 114, Intro to Communication course, as an ENGL 098 "waiver" course so that students who were not at the ENGL 101 level could earn credits toward a Mass Media Associate of Arts degree. With the development of the Accelerated Learning Program and co-requisite model in English, this is no longer necessary. The department now has approved Corequisite Program versions of ENGL 115 and ENGL 107 (both required), and ENGL 116 (a Mass Media elective) under a similar pretext – this will help developmental English students earn credits toward their degrees, and hopefully be more encouraged about their prospects.

The final audit assessment discussed was related to the quality and variety of the evaluation assessment measures done to ensure alignment between the program learning outcomes and student learning outcomes; faculty collaboration on assessment planning; and the extent to which the programs incorporate mass media education trends to prepare students and ensure success after graduation. As a result of the audit, it was suggested that the department evaluate whether an alignment exists between the program learning outcomes and the student learning outcomes and ensure that this alignment is clear to faculty, students, and administration. To improve on the suggested step following the audit, Dr. Sanders stated that the department filed course and program addenda with the primary purpose of revising Course Learning Outcomes (CLOs) and Program Learning

Outcomes (PLOs) to be in better alignment so that the language of the outcomes would make them more clearly assessable. She further shared that the unit faculty have been trained on our Assessment, Evaluation, Feedback and Intervention System (AEFIS) and incorporated it into their course design with a high level of faculty adoption.

Dr. Sanders closed by stating that media dominates how most information is shared globally. Through innovation, the digital landscape will continue to evolve and present an opportunity for the Mass Media program to examine areas for growth that can better prepare students for future careers in multimedia journalism.

Following the Mass Media APR discussion, Trustee Fulmore-Townsend inquired about the timeline for combining the Communications and Mass Media degree programs. In response to Trustee Fulmore-Townsend, Dr. Marshall suggested that it would be ideal to wait to align the Mass Media program curriculum with that of Temple University. She further explained that there is usually at least a year before the curriculum can be revised and full alignment can take place through the College's curriculum development and approval process in compliance with internal and external regulations.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend also noticed that 41% of students do not persist in completing the program and asked about the barriers students have encountered that has prevented them from graduating. Dr. Birge-Caracappa and Dr. Sanders both explained that the pandemic has negatively impacted student persistence and retention and the support services that were available during that time within the program review period.

#### (c) Communication Studies Associate of Arts (A.A.) Academic Program Review (A)

Dr. Sanders began by highlighting that enrollment in the Communication Studies (COMM) program that averaged 137 students per semester between Fall 2017 and Fall 2022. During that time, there was a 57% decrease in enrollment with a post-COVID low experienced in Spring 2022. However, there has been an 8.9% increase in enrollment from Fall 2021 to Fall 2022. She further explained that on average, the distribution of gender and ethnicity within the Communication Studies program is representative of the college population. The most notable difference is the percentage of Black males enrolled in Communication Studies of 23.5%, which is greater than that at the college overall percentage which is 12.8%. The number of students who are enrolled in the Communication Studies program, who are between the ages of 16 to 21 years, is 50.8% which is higher than that of the college overall at 41.3%.

Dr. Sanders then shared information regarding retention of students within the Communication Studies program. She stated the program's Fall to Spring average retention between 2017 and 2021 of those who returned to same program was 58.4%, averaging 3% lower than the college average of 61.4%. On average, 62.8% of students returned to the same program or graduated, while 64.6% of students college-wide returned to the same program or graduated. She added that the program's Fall to Fall retention increased by 10.9 % from 26.9% in Fall 2017 to 37.8% in Fall 2021. Between the years 2017 through 2022, Communication Studies awarded a total of 154 degrees. Students

within the program who returned to the same program or those who graduated, increased by 10.1 % during the period studied, from 41% in Fall 2017 to 51.1% in Fall 2021.

Dr. Sanders continued by sharing the Communication Studies department's program responses from a prior audit and action items that were carried out. The first action item was regarding 15 out of 23 articulation agreements that have not been utilized and were automatically created as part of the Pennsylvania Transfer and Articulation Center. She stated that since the last audit, Temple's Communication programs underwent a significant restructuring, with their Strategic Communication program emerging as Communication and Social Influence in Fall 2018. It was therefore a difficult time to work with them, and unfortunately, CCP did not manage to enter discussions before the COVID-19 pandemic.

Another audit response Dr. Sanders shared was related to improving on retention with a focus on students earning less than twelve credits. Over a five-year time period, the Communication Studies program enrolled on average, 254 students a year. The largest population of students to depart the college from the Communication Studies was those that earned less than twelve credits. Approximately 45% of the students who departed the Communication Studies program earned less than twelve credits. She stated that since the last audit, both recruitment and retention continue to be an area of concern for the Communication Studies program. One of the most notable changes that has occurred in recent years has been partnering with the Developmental English unit to offer linked sections of Public Speaking and Interpersonal Communication through the Corequisite Program.

Dr. Sanders stated that another audit response regarded an evaluation of the quality and variety of the evaluation assessment measures done to ensure alignment between the program learning outcomes and student learning outcomes. This has been addressed through faculty collaboration on assessment planning; the extent to which the programs incorporate mass media education trends, and changes to assessment to better prepare students and ensure success after graduation. She explained that since the last audit, the Communication Studies department filed a course and program addenda during the Spring of 2020, with the intention of revising CLOs and PLOs to be in better alignment and more accessible.

Dr. Sanders concluded by stating communication is at the root of every successful organization, business, and team, whether it's digital, interpersonal, intercultural, written or spoken. The program should investigate how Communication Studies can connect with the interests of current and prospective students in these growing occupational and professional opportunities. The Communication Studies program currently provides students with the foundational skills to succeed in upper-level courses at Temple, and other four-year local institutions. In an economy in which artificial intelligence algorithms can perform more and more knowledge and information work, human communication skills are even more essential to professional success, as these skills can't be automated.

Following Dr. Sanders' discussion on the Communication Studies APR, Trustee McPherson stated that tourism and visitation is becoming bigger in the city of

Philadelphia and mobilizing in a major way. She mentioned that Media Relations is a good skill to know along with Social Media. She expressed that students should be taught the business side of communications as well, so they can think and conduct their work within the industry strategically, or even consider consulting, or going into business for themselves.

Trustee McPherson also shared the importance of students of color to know all aspects of media and marketing within the real world. Two organizations she suggested as a means of networking that students within the Communications program should be connected to are the National Association of Black Journalists, and the National Black Public Relations Society. Through both networks, students would be introduced to diversity, mass media practices, and the opportunities for creativity, and career directions. She also mentioned it would be a good idea to strategize ways to introduce current and prospective students to the wide range of career opportunities by engaging them with the local Communications professional community through introductions, speakers, and internships. Trustee McPherson also mentioned that entrepreneurship could also be considered as a career choice of students within the program.

Dr. Marshall shared that the Interim Dean of Business and Technology is working on a Business Honors program that will complement the future STEM Honors program. This program will likely have an option for students to work with small businesses within the City through our PowerUp program which will provide great opportunities for students to engage in Communications and Mass Media projects with Philadelphia businesses.

Trustee McPherson also stated that non-profit vs. for profit communication is different, and it would be great for students to know best practices for both. Trustee Posoff suggested that a relationship be developed with crisis communication firms for students to be able to learn from and interact with while studying. Perhaps the college could have speakers visit, have classes for students, or have advisory committee members with this expertise.

Trustee Fulmore-Townsend thanked the guests and stated that if media is an evolving field, then the program will need to proactively meet the needs of students so they are successful in the Communications industry.

Following the departure of the meeting guests, Trustee Fulmore –Townsend asked why both the Communication Studies and Mass Media programs were not yet merged. She also inquired why Temple University is driving the timeline for merging the communications programs at CCP.

Dr. Marshall explained that Temple University is a top transfer institution for CCP Communications and Mass Media majors so it is to the benefit of our students to ensure program alignment and articulation. That said, we also have students who intend to transfer to other institutions that have different curricula. Curricular alignment is needed for multiple institutions if we are to meet the needs of our diverse student population. This makes curricular changes and alignment a challenging process. She also shared that

significant changes to the college's curriculum involves multiple steps and approvals which takes at least a year or more. Moving forward, the department will begin conversations with faculty and staff at Temple and other top transfer institutions to best align our curriculum as soon as possible.

Trustee McPherson inquired about other schools that can be considered as college partners for CCP, such as HBCUs, Wharton, or Penn. She mentioned CCP should cast the net and make it wide. In response, Dr. Marshall pointed out the challenge of partnering that often occurs when identifying college partners is when four-year institutions and curriculums don't align well with each other and we must align our curriculum to all. However, there are some avenues and institutions we have not explored that can also be examined. Trustee McPherson commented that the schools she suggested should be looked at in addition to (Temple University), not instead of (Temple University). She further stated that we should think outside the box when partnering with local institutions. Dr. Marshall explained there is a process that will need to take place that will require a resource investment. She explained that there is a strategic approach in how we will need to identify and navigate institution partners and establish a synergy with other schools. Trustee Posoff asked if the College could also consider West Chester or LaSalle.

Dr. Gray informed the committee that the College is having discussions with 20 potential transfer partners to provide insight on CCP programs and future direction. Temple University is where most of CCP college program and curriculum credits directly transfer. Temple University is better aligned with many of our programs than some other transfer institutions. However, our students choose to transfer from to most of the 20 Dual Admission partners that the college has articulation agreements with. Trustee Posoff stated that the college should begin to develop a strategic plan and long-term goals related to this as communication is a major part of the city of Philadelphia, and that internship opportunities should be identified and explored strategically.

Trustee Fulmore –Townsend asked why there was a delay in consolidating the programs. She voiced that one program appears to be rebounding in enrollment, while the other program is struggling. She further expressed that both the Communication Studies and Mass Media programs should be merged into one program and a plan should be formed to bring the merge to fruition. Dr. Marshall stated that when programs are eliminated or consolidated, it could potentially cause problems with faculty resources and staffing. This needs to be done thoughtfully and must include intention around aligning the new merged curriculum with our transfer partners' programs. This as well as the internal curriculum revision and approval process, will take some time.

Trustee McPherson stated that fund development, and the marketing components that fall under fund development should be included within the newly merged program. She also insisted that students be taught English writing skills.

Trustee Fulmore –Townsend asked Dr. Judy Gay for clarity on the approval process of academic programs and the Board's role. Dr. Gay confirmed that academic programs are approved every five years and the Board has the authority to approve or not approve a

program. They can also approve the program for another time period. The Board began to discuss ways to meet the goal of integrating both the Communication Studies and Mass Media programs to be aligned with the industry within the next three years. Trustee McPherson said that as the programs are being merged, the new program is going to look like a startup. For instance, during the first year, the framework will be developed. During the second year, the Board could hear about actions to implement, and during the third year is when the full implementation would occur.

Dr. Marshall explained that before the program merge takes place, it must be considered which courses will be added, and which courses would be revised or removed. The changes would need to be made with minimal negative input to the students. She also informed the Board that data informed decisions must be made, and that it needs to be reviewed and approved by the appropriate individuals.

At the close of the discussion, Trustee Fulmore –Townsend recommended that the Communication Studies and Mass Media programs be approved for renewal with a request that both programs be approved for 3 years and updated in 2 years. All were in favor and the recommendation was unanimously approved.

After the approval vote passed, Trustee Fulmore –Townsend requested that a shift in dates and time of the Student Outcomes Committee be made for the coming year. She stated that in the past, the Student Outcomes meetings took place before the Board meetings. She requested that Dr. Marshall consider changing the dates for next year starting in the fall as an effort to stay on target with governance.

(d) New Business

(I)

There was no new business.

Attachments: