

**MEETING OF THE BUSINESS AFFAIRS COMMITTEE
OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
Community College of Philadelphia
Wednesday, January 23, 2019 – 10:00 A.M.**

Present: Ms. Suzanne Biemiller, Mr. Harold Epps, Mr. Joseph Martz (via Zoom), Mr. Jeremiah J. White, Jr. (via Zoom), Dr. Donald Generals, Dr. Pam Carter, Ms. Carol de Fries, Mr. Jacob Eapen, Dr. Judith Gay, Dr. Samuel Hirsch, Mr. Gim Lim, Mr. Gregory Murphy, Mr. James P. Spiewak, Victoria Zellers, Esq. and Invited Guest: Mr. Craig Stock (via Zoom)

AGENDA

PUBLIC SESSION

(1) Architect Selection for the Career and Advanced Technology Center. (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Eapen described to the Committee the RFP process that was undertaken to select an architect for the West Regional Center project. He stated that it is the College's intention to transform the West Philadelphia Regional Center into a destination center providing high-quality academic, career and technical programs supporting the career-focused students entering the region's workforce. The main objective of this effort is to create a dynamic, identity focused center that will provide students the ideal learning environment where they will be able to define and master technologies of the ever-evolving workplace demands. The College received seventeen (17) proposals. Fees for Parts 1 and 2 ranged from \$1.55 million to \$2.79 million as shown in Attachment A. The eight firms that proposed fees lower than 10% of the project budget of \$22 million were evaluated and five firms were invited to make a presentation to the Evaluation Committee. The Evaluation Committee consisted of the VP for Business & Finance; the VP for Workforce & Economic Innovation; the Dean of Business & Technology; and the Associate VP for Budgets & Business Services. Dr. Generals noted that Ms. de Fries, VP for Workforce & Economic Innovation. and Dr. Carter, Dean of Business & Technology, provided knowledge on the desired curriculum aspects of the facility. The Evaluation Committee used the criteria outlined in Attachment B. From this group, two (2) firms, the Schrader Group who partnered with Lavalley Brensinger Architects and CDI dba L.R. Kimball were invited back to make presentations to the President and the Cabinet. All of the firms that made presentations included minority participation and a high percentage of their team were Philadelphia-based.

The RFP reflected the College's intention to have the West Regional Center to be a destination center focusing on workforce development programs. The RFP further detailed that the project will include two parts. Part 1 – A design for construction of a technology rich facility of approximately 50,000 ft² focused on Automotive and Transportation Technology as the anchor program inclusive of advanced fuel systems of passenger vehicles; large-scale vehicles and equipment; stationary power equipment; and marine craft. Underground parking and an upper level of adaptive instructional spaces for classroom, study space and various manufacturing training spaces. Part 2 – A redesign of existing space of about 24,000 Ft² for Advanced Technology programs in: manufacturing; energy and trades training with advanced specialized industry equipment; business and information technology; healthcare training; and adaptive instructional

spaces for classrooms. Respondents were also asked to provide additional pricing for: (a) a third floor incorporated onto the Automotive Technology building and (b) the demolition of the existing 24,000 Ft² and replacement with a two-story building is also being considered.

Mr. Eapen explained that the College had initially planned in expanding the facilities utilized for the Automotive Technology program at the West Regional Center. The expansion would allow for increased enrollment in the existing program and would also enable the College to offer courses related to diesel and other alternative fuels. The 2017 Facilities Master Plan identified the need for a facility of 44,000 square feet to meet the programming needs. To transform into a destination center, the College desires to establish the West Regional Center as a Career and Advanced Technology Center to address the workforce needs of the City and offer courses in advanced manufacturing, energy, trades, business and information technology and healthcare training. As part of the fiscal year 2018-2019 PDE (Pennsylvania Department of Education) capital request process, staff identified the West Regional Center Expansion project, which had been submitted in a previous year, as its "carry-over" project. On August 15, 2018 the College received notice from PDE that the project was approved for \$20 million with PDE providing 50% of the debt service payments.

The Schrader Group made a presentation to the Committee. They outlined their approach to the project and provided examples of similar project work. They also presented some concepts for consideration which included three floors for the building on the automotive technology site and the demolition of the existing regional center for surface parking. They also noted that their minority participation is as follows: Arora Engineers (MBE 27.6%); KSE Engineers (MBE 6.4%); Metropolitan Acoustics (2% WBE); and New Age Development Group (2% DBE). All of the project team's firms have offices in Philadelphia with the exception of New Age Development Group (Conshohocken, PA) and Lavalley Brensinger Architects, the automotive technology and educations specialists who are based in Boston, MA.

After the Schrader Group presentation, the Committee members had a discussion about the project which included project schedule, length of construction period and potential sites for the temporary relocation of the automotive technology program during construction. In response to questions, staff stated that Econsult Solutions will be engaged to perform an environmental scan which will help College staff better determine program needs. It was also noted that the preliminary list of workforce development programs to be conducted at the site is in line with the City's objectives.

In response to project costs, Mr. Eapen noted that the original cost was estimated to be \$22M. However, with the additional programming, the new building will be about a 75,000 square foot building which increases the project cost to \$27M to \$30M. The combination of the Pennsylvania Department of Education (PDE), the Redevelopment Assistance Capital Program (RACP), New Market Tax Credits (NMTC), and Community College of Philadelphia bond funds will be the sources and uses of funds. The Business Affairs Committee desires to see proforma on both financing and operations. The Trustees had several questions on the programs, the revenues that will be generated, and the costs for running the programs. Trustee Epps directed the staff to provide proforma of revenues and expenses.

Action: Mr. White moved and Mr. Martz seconded the motion that the Committee recommend to the full Board to award the contract to the Schrader Group for the Career and Advanced Technology Center in the amount of \$2,100,000 contingent upon the staff providing the sources and uses of funds for the construction and proforma of revenues and expenses for the programs at the proposed Center. The motion passed unanimously.

(2) Next Meeting Date (Information Item)

A discussion took place about changing the start time of future Business Affairs Committee meetings. The Committee agreed to change the start time to 9:00 A.M.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

An Executive Session followed the Public Session.

ATTACHMENT A

**Fees Submitted from Architectural Firms
For Parts 1 and 2 of the RFP
Career and Advanced Technology Center**

**Fees for
Parts 1 & 2**

Wallace Roberts & Todd, LLC	\$1,547,531
NORR	\$1,628,825
HDR	\$1,669,105
CDI Architects Group LLC dba L.R. Kimball	\$1,741,504
Granum A/I	\$1,870,774
Schrader Group Architecture, LLC	\$1,877,725
ATANE (formerly HAKS)	\$1,966,902
WRA	\$2,129,123
BHA	\$2,192,764
Hollwich Kushner	\$2,249,540
Francis Cauffman	\$2,266,355
Marvel Architects, PLLC	\$2,429,933
Erdy McHenry Architecture, LLC	\$2,516,532
Gensler	\$2,518,608
Daroff Design	\$2,557,244
ROGERS PARTNERS Architects + Urban Designers	\$2,718,918
NK Architects, P.A.	\$2,787,886

ATTACHMENT B

Criteria Used for the Architect Selection Career and Advanced Technology Center

EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS

Proposals will be evaluated for the most cost effective and responsive to the needs of the College. The College, at its sole discretion, will make final determination of the proposal responsiveness and reserves the right to award all, partial or none of the elements of the proposal. Proposals will be reviewed by the College Selection Committee consisting of representatives from Budget and Finance, Purchasing, Facilities, Information Technology Staff, Business and Technology and Workforce Development. The award of the services associated with this RFP may or may not be made to the Contractor submitting the lowest price Cost Proposal. The award will be made to the contractor whose Proposal is determined to be the most advantageous to the College, taking into consideration, without limitation the evaluation factors set forth below.

1. Quality of Team:

- a) Composition of the team and alignment with project objectives
- b) The degree to which the personnel on the Contractor Team have held responsible project positions for similar projects;
- c) Demonstrated depth and higher education experience creating:
 - i. Automotive service training centers
 - ii. Advance manufacturing instructional labs and instructional spaces
 - iii. Shared collaborative spaces
 - iv. Flexible spaces with adaptive technologies
- d) The degree to which the Contractor Team brings experience in the full range of skills and expertise needed to accomplish the scope of work in all task areas;
- e) The degree of project experience energizing and integrating internal and external common spaces and courtyards
- f) The specific commitments made in the Proposal for staffing the Contractor Team, including percent of time dedicated by Project Manager and senior members who are experienced and most aligned with project objectives.
- g) Contributions of Technology and Educational Specialists in support of project
- h) Experience within the local permitting region
- i) Experience planning projects in phased fully occupied and operational, spaces and functions
- j) Detailers efficient in AutoCAD, REVIT, and BIM.
- k) Any other experience and/or criteria the committee deems relevant.

2. Work Plan and Defined Approach to Project and Project Schedule

- a) Proposed organization of the work;
- b) Unique capabilities that may influence the Project;
- c) Understanding of the appropriate levels of effort required (hours) and approach for tasks required for:
- d) Information Collection: Collaboration plan integrating faculty, staff, students, administration, outside consultants and other architectural firms
- e) Needs Assessment: Develop a comprehensive understanding of the intent of the project, the infrastructures in-place or available
- f) Program Development: Providing Alternative Approaches to generate a minimum of three ideas for solutions
- g) Schematic Design: Designs that defines the general scope and conceptual design of the project
- h) Design Development: Detailed design development for a clear and coordinated description of all aspects of the design including Architectural, Mechanical, Plumbing, Electrical and Fire Protection Systems
- i) Construction Documents: Construction documents which consist of permitting, bid and conformed set of drawings, and specifications for a complete and comprehensive project manual.
- j) Procurement: Support of the college procurement practice of bidding, responding to Requests for Information, reviewing responses, making recommendations for multiple prime contracts and contractor negotiation through contract award and reconciling any cost differences and/or revising design drawings to bring the costs in line to the estimate or college budget.
- k) Contract Administration: Overseeing construction to ensure conformity to construction drawings, specifications, and standards. Weekly meetings, submittal review, requests for information, accurate tracking and management of pay applications, certified payroll, change order management, support to the General Trades Contractor and all other necessary efforts to oversee the project through successful close-out and completion.

Identification of Project risks and methods to mitigate or eliminate such risks to complete the Project within the proposed schedule, estimated budget and with the quality and/or performance specifications identified herein

3. Financials and Alignment with College's Form of Agreement

- a) Price, Alternate Price and/or cost items deemed in the best interest of the College
- b) Costs and Fees
- c) Breakdown of hours and percentage of time allocated to senior members who are experienced and most aligned with project objectives throughout the project.
- d) Value added and cost savings achieved from previous projects
- e) Alignment with the College AIA –B101 Form of Agreement and AIA A201 Terms and Conditions

4. Quality of Overall Proposal

- a) Project Interpretation
- b) Collaborative Approach
- c) Team experience implementing projects in fully occupied and operational spaces.
- d) Understanding of programming the technological demands supporting emerging academic pedagogies to enhance the intellectual environments and backbone to incorporate new technologies and facilitate future initiatives
- e) Any other proposal qualities, features, and/or criteria the College deems relevant.